![ISO logo]

Technical Committee 184: Industrial automation systems and integration
Subcommittee 4: Industrial data

ISO CD Ballot Results
for ISO 13584-0102
View exchange protocol by ISO 10303 conforming specification

The ballot was circulated among SC4 members for its vote on 2000-08-21,13 of our 18 P-members responded to the ballot:

COUNTRY	VOTE	COMMENTS
Australia	Y	
Canada	A	
China	Y	
Czech Republic		
France	Y	Attached
Germany	Y	
Italy	Y	
Japan	Y	Attached
Korea, Rep. Of	Y	Attached
Netherlands	Y	
Norway	Y	
Portugal	Y	
Russia		
Spain		
Sweden	A	
Switzerland	Y	
United Kingdom		
United States	Y	Attached

The SC4 Secretary has reviewed the ballot responses and in consultation with the Chair has decided tha the next draft of 13584-0102 will go forward for registration as a DIS, after addressing the comments raised in the CD ballot.

This document is also available digitally through SOLIS via ftp or www http://www.nist.gov/sc4/ndocs/n1119Address reply to:

Ballot Comments

NOTE:
Some of these comment may have been scanned using Optical Character Recognition and have not been verified as 100% accurate. Please refer to the original hard copy in cases of irregularities.

France

Annex to ISO/CD 13584-102 ballot
French Comments

France agrees to the circulation of the draft as a DIS with the following comments :

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-01
ORIGINATOR: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD:
DESCRIPTION:
- The balloted document does not reference the 2nd edition of ISO 10303 parts
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
Reference ISO 10303-43:2000, ISO 10303-41:2000

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-02
ORIGINATOR: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD:
DESCRIPTION:
The balloted document does not conform to the SC4 Supplementary directives.
In particular:
- presentation of the TOC is not correct.
- Presentation of Express constructs is not correct (e.g. absence of declaration of function parameters);
- Index content should not be bolded;
- Probably also, use of colored text (red and blue) is not allowed (by SC4 or even by ISO CS).
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
Conform to ISO and SC4 editorial directives.

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-03
ORIGINATOR: E.SARDET
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD: Clause 6.3.2
DESCRIPTION:
There is a syntax error in function protocol_compliant_to_cc.
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
Change p.version by p.protocol_version in wherever it appears.

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-04
ORIGINATOR: E.SARDET
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD: Clause 2 and 3
DESCRIPTION:
Part 31 is referenced in Clause 3 and does not appear in the normative references list. Moreover, it has been published in 1999.
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
Update the normative reference (clause 2) with:
ISO 13584-31:1999, Industrial automation systems and integration — Parts library — Part 31: Implementation resource: Geometric programming interface.
In clause 3, change ISO 13584-31 1) by ISO 13584-31:1999.

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-05
ORIGINATOR: E.SARDET
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD: Clause 4.3.1
DESCRIPTION:
The null value of the step_cc view control variable should be precised. Does it correspond to all conformance classes, or does it mean that no conformance class is defined for the application protocol?
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
Precise the meaning of this null value.

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-06
ORIGINATOR: E.SARDET
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD: Clause 6
DESCRIPTION:
Bad reference to clause number.
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
Change "The method for identifying representation entities is enumerated with method 1 corresponding to the method defined in Clause 6.1"

By

"The method for identifying representation entities is enumerated with method 1 corresponding to the method defined in Clause 5.1"

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-07
ORIGINATOR: G. PIERRA
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD: Foreword
DESCRIPTION: Old version of the Foreword
The Foreword still contains description of Part 50 to 59 and 500 to 599 that are no longer defined.
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
Duplicate Foreword e.g., from ISO 13584-101

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-09
ORIGINATOR: G. PIERRA
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD: clause 1
DESCRIPTION: Note 2 should be an example

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-10
ORIGINATOR: G. PIERRA
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD: clause 3
DESCRIPTION: The numbering of footnotes should restart at 1 on each page

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-11
ORIGINATOR: G. PIERRA
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD: clause 6.3
DESCRIPTION: LIIM_xx_library_implicit_schema should be simple to obtain
The current way for building a LIIM_xx_library_implicit_schema consists in generating a long form from a short form and additional constraint schemas. This process is difficult, in particular due to the lack of reliability of most EXPRESS tools. Another easier process should be defined

PROPOSED SOLUTION:
Provide for each LIIM a long form already generated, and explain how this long form is to be completed when one want to reference VEP 102 together with this LIIM

ISSUE NUMBER: FR-12
ORIGINATOR: G. PIERRA
SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD: clause 6.3.2.4
DESCRIPTION: nonexistent AP or CC are allowed to be referenced
The current constraint enforces to reference only AP the number of which are between 200 and 299 and CC
between 1 and 99. Obviously some of these AP or CC do not exist
PROPOSED SOLUTION:

Japan

ISSUE NUMBER   JPN CD 13584-102-1.
AUTHOR   M.Kawanobe
CLAUSE   4.2, Page 7, First line
CLASSIFICATION Minor Technical
DESCRIPTION   The sentence "The functional_view_class instance does not contain any view_properties." is
confusing and looks to contradicts the NOTE2.
PROPOSED SOLUTION   The functional_view_class instance of the ISO10303_rep representation category
does not contain any view_properties.

ISSUE NUMBER   JPN CD 13584-102-2.
AUTHOR   M.Kawanobe
CLAUSE   4.2.1, Page 7, NOTE
CLASSIFICATION Minor Editorial
DESCRIPTION   'ISO 13584-26' should be 'ISO 13584-26:2000'

ISSUE NUMBER   JPN CD 13584-102-3.
AUTHOR   M.Kawanobe
CLAUSE   4.3.2, Page 8
CLASSIFICATION Major Technical
DESCRIPTION   It is not possible to precisely identify a conformance class of the ISO 10303 application
protocol with integer values only. For example, AP203 defines the conformance class '1a' and '1b'.

ISSUE NUMBER   JPN CD 13584-102-4.
AUTHOR   M.Kawanobe
CLAUSE   6, Page 11, Second paragraph
CLASSIFICATION Minor Editorial
DESCRIPTION   'The method for identifying representation entities is enumerated with method 1
corresponding to the method defined in Clause 6.1 and...'
should be
'The method for identifying representation entities is enumerated with method 1 corresponding to the method
defined in Clause 5.1 and...'

ISSUE NUMBER   JPN CD 13584-102-5.
AUTHOR   M.Kawanobe
CLAUSE   6, Page 11, Third paragraph
CLASSIFICATION Minor Technical
DESCRIPTION   It should be described how to interpret the 'conformance class ISO_10303_203-2-2'.
ISSUE NUMBER   JPN CD 13584-102-6.
AUTHOR   M.Kawanobe
CLAUSE   6.3.2.1, Page 14, Description of the constraint for the level attribute
CLASSIFICATION Minor Editorial
DESCRIPTION   " if it exists, shall have '1', '2' until '99' as its 'value'."
should be
" if it exists, shall have '01', '02' until '99' as its 'value'."
The value of external_file_protocol.level is constrained as 'a string of two digits' in clause 6.3.1.

ISSUE NUMBER   JPN CD 13584-102-7.

AUTHOR   M.Kawanobe
CLAUSE   6.3.2.1, Page 15, Definition of FUNCTION 'protocol_compliant_to_cc'
CLASSIFICATION   Minor Technical
DESCRIPTION   1) 'p.version' should be 'p.level'
2) Inconsistent parenthesis(1 extra, 1 insufficient)
3) Maximum value for level attribute should be 99
PROPOSED SOLUTION   Replace

AND
(p.version LIKE '##')
AND
((((0 < value(p.version)) AND (value(p.version <= 50)))
THEN

With

AND
(p.level LIKE '##')
AND
((0 < value(p.level)) AND (value(p.level) <= 99)))
THEN

United States

  Report on review ISO/CD 13584-102

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-1
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: General
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: Throughout the document, spaces occur before colons. This is not correct English style.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Remove the spaces before colons.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-2
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: General
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: Labeling of examples is inconsistent. Sometimes the word "example" is capitalized, sometimes
 it is not.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Capitalize EXAMPLE in the labels of all examples.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-3
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 1
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: In the first item of the first list, there is a word missing after "called" in "representation
category called," and another word missing after "that" in "that to be used".
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Add the missing word after "called". Change "that to be used" to "that are to be
used".
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-4
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 1
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: In the third item of the first list, "supported on any implementation," the word "on" is
awkward and is inconsistent with wording elsewhere.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Change "on" to "by".
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-5

AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 1
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: In the fourth item of the first list, there is an extra word in "supported by of any implementation".
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Delete "of".
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-6
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 1
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: The first item of the second list ends with a period.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Change the period to a semicolon.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-7
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 2 CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: The references to standards have a space after the colon. This is inconsistent with the ISO Directives and with the references in Clause 3.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Remove the spaces after colons.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-8
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 4.2.1
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: "This set of information provides a universal identification of the ISO10303-rep represesentation category, and constitutes its view logical name." Is this a requirement, or a restatement of information found elsewhere in ISO 13584?
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Change to a note.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-9
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 4.2.2
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Technical
DESCRIPTION: "The functional view class is characterized using the view control variables whose universal identification and respective data types are described in Table 2." There does not appear to be any description of a data type in Table 2.
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-10
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: Table 2
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: The header is missing for the portion of Table 2 on Page 8.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Make the entire Table 2 fit on one apge.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-11
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 4.3.1
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: "STEP_AP" is capitalized in the text of but not in Table 2.
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-12

AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 4.3.2
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: "STEP_AP" is capitalized in the text of but not in Table 2.
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-13
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 4.3.2
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Technical
DESCRIPTION: The meaning of a 0 ('null') value for step_cc is not explained.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Explain it.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-14
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 4.3.3
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: The name of the detail_level view control variable appears within single quotes here, but step_ap and step_cc do not.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Remove the quotes.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-15
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: Figures 1, 2 and 3
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: The text in these figures is too small. Figures 2 and 3, have an ugly "raster" look and are not publication-quality.
PROPOSED SOLUTION:
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-16
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 4.3.3
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: In the second paragraph, the name of the side view control variable appears within single quotes, but not in the first paragraph.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Remove the quotes.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-17
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 4.3.5
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: There is a space before the comma after "complex part".
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Remove the space.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-18
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 6.1
CLASSIFICATION: Major, Technical
DESCRIPTION: "Furthermore, the API must return a pointer..." The term "pointer" is not defined. It is probably not the intent to exclude programming langauges that do not support pointers (e.g., FORTRAN and Java). Anyway, the purpose of this requirement is not clear.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Elaborate on this requirement and replace "pointer" with another word that is properly defined.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-19
AUTHOR: USA   CLAUSE: 6.3
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: "The set of allowed values is defined textually in clause 6.3.1 that specifies for each conformance class the allowed values of view_exchange_protocol_id.name." This is a run-on sentence.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Split into at least two sentences. End the first sentence after "6.3.1".
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-20
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 6.3
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: "defined in this part of I SO13584 in any of its conformance class" is ambiguous. Does it mean any conformance class of the library delivery file, or any conformance class of this part of ISO 13584?
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Clarify.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-21
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 6.3
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: "all the shemas referenced from SHORT_L": "schemas" is misspelled.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Change "shemas" to "schemas".
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-22
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 6.3.2
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Editorial
DESCRIPTION: In the note, the text after the tabs does not line up.
PROPOSED SOLUTION: Line up "ISO 135684-24", "ISO 13584-41", etc.
RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER: USA-PLIB102CD-23
AUTHOR: USA
CLAUSE: 6.3.2.4
CLASSIFICATION: Minor, Technical
DESCRIPTION: The allowable values for data_exchange_specification_id.status are given as "WD", "CD", "DIS", "FDIS" and "IS". A part can have many working drafts. How are they distinguished. Also, how are drafts after the CD level distinguished (e.g., a "pre_IS" version)?
PROPOSED SOLUTION: